

MINUTES CITY OF LAKE WORTH BEACH HISTORIC RESOURCES PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING CITY HALL COMMISSION CHAMBER WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 08, 2023 -- 6:02 PM

ROLL CALL and RECORDING OF ABSENCES Present were: Robert D'Arinzo; Nadine Heitz, Laura Devlin, Edmond LeBlanc; Elaine DeRiso; Edmund Deveaux. Also present were: Anne Greening, Senior Preservation Planner; Yeneneh Terefe, Preservation Planner; Elizabeth Lenihan, Board Attorney; William Waters, Director for Community Sustainability; Sherie Coale, Board Secretary.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

BOARD MEMBER ELECTION

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair

N. Heitz nominates R. D'Arinzo as Chairman; E. Deveaux 2nd.

R. D'Arinzo nominates N. Heitz as Vice-Chair; E. Deveaux 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

ADDITIONS / DELETIONS / REORDERING AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA None APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

A. October 11, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Motion: L. Devlin moved to accept the October 11, 2023 meeting minutes as presented; E. LeBlanc

 2^{nd} .

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

CASES

SWEARING IN OF STAFF AND APPLICANTS Board Secretary administered oath to those wishing to give testimony.

PROOF OF PUBLICATION - None required

WITHDRAWLS / POSTPONEMENTS None

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

BOARD DISCLOSURE: L. Devlin – Several months prior she was in attendance at a Commission meeting for the Gulfstream Hotel, held up a preprinted sign in favor of the approval as did many others. Is a Facebook friend with Amy Gill as are many people. Believes she can be impartial and participate in a fair manner. Has had no direct involvement in the project other than what is stated. Has no financial interest, no ethical conflicts of interest.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

A. HRPB Project Number 23-00100241: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for window and door replacements at the property located at 213 Fordham Drive. The subject property is a non-contributing resource to the College Park Historic District and is located in the Single-Family Residential (SFR) zoning district.

Staff: A. Greening presents case findings and analysis. With minimal alterations over time, the structure maintains sufficient historic integrity and as it has reached the 50-year threshold, it is recommended that to become a contributing property. The COA applied for in August 2023 was disapproved at time of permit due to incompatible doors and windows on openings 1-4 (which are seen from the public right-of-way.

Opening #3 (door) staff offered the compromise of a 2-panel door for the utilitarian storage entrance. The application of an exterior, horizontal muntin, on opening #4, would continue to imitate the appearance of the two-light awning window. Staff could not approve the preferred door proposals for Openings #1 and #2. Staff did offer five other style appropriate impact doors, none of which were acceptable to the applicant. Leaded and textured glass are not appropriate as per the Design Guidelines for the Masonry Vernacular home. Hi- style homes such as Tudor Revival, French Eclectic, High-Style Prairie may have utilized leaded, textured glass. These are not found in Lake Worth Beach, the masonry vernacular would have had much simpler doors. Those now found in the districts will need to meet the criteria when replaced; those installed without permit could receive code violations.

Staff recommends denial as the application is not consistent with the Design Guidelines or the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Applicant: Amanda Kahan 213 Fordham Drive – Has lived in College Park for about four (4) years and is civically involved. She cites homeowners insurance costs as the impetus for hardening the structure. Applicant states the doors are already purchased and she cannot afford to purchase new doors. None of the designs were available through the company they were utilizing for installation. The suggested door styles are not seen in the neighborhood as shown in the Design Guidelines. The front door is west facing not street facing, the garage door is blocked by a car. Believes what they chose is close to the guidelines and match what is happening in the neighborhood.

Public Comment: None

Chair reminds applicant the doors are a prominent feature of the house and neighborhood consistency will be more evident as time progresses.

Board: E. Deveaux motions to approve. N. Heitz disagrees with the motion as the Board is tasked to adhere to the guidelines. Reasons to stray from the guidelines/criteria need to be justified.

Board Attorney: Competent substantial evidence should be placed on the record to support each of the criteria to be approved; the staff report and criteria address a denial.

Staff confirms that since it is non-contributing the review is limited to the part visible from the street. If it were contributing the entire perimeter would be subject to review.

Board: E. DeRiso has questions about the hardship claim. **Response:** The doors were purchased prior to the applicant being layed off.

Board Secretary: Swears in the spokesperson for the applicant.

Salesman: Brian Homan 1096 Grove Park Circle Boynton Beach- Spoke about whether there would be any issues and did not see a particular problem. The doors cost @ \$7 K approximately four months ago. My Safe Florida Home- will receive a rebate if completed by April 2024.

Board: N. Heitz queries salesperson if he has ever worked in the historic districts prior to this instance; **Response**: Yes, however he did not think they were doing anything wrong based on what he saw in neighborhood. They cannot be returned as they are custom made. The salesman stated manufacturing occurred while the permit was being processed. Cannot meet the April deadline and grant if applying for the hardship.

Board: L. Devlin: Understands there may be a parity issue (my house should look like everyone else's home) and economic hardship. Evidence of hardship is necessary to claim hardship. E. DeRiso: There would not be an issue if a door was selected that was suggested by staff.

Salesperson: Questions if Board will make all homeowners compliant?

Board Chair and member do not want to set a precedent.

Board Attorney: The desired doors could not be approved via the Economic Hardship Application

Board: E. Deveaux states other cities have guidelines on their website and are available to the public.

Staff and Board members mention the City of Lake Worth Beach Design Guidelines have been online for several years and the applicant was directed to the guidelines. They failed with due diligence and made an assumption. E. LeBlanc mentions not being able to approve based on hardship as no evidence or hardship application was produced.

Board Attorney: Each of the criteria must be justified in order to recommend approval of the request. A question about being.

Motion: E. Deveaux moves to approve HRPB 23-00100241 for door #1, the front door, as it does not directly face the street and is recessed (west facing); door #2, carport door, shall comply with the City recommendation as it is front facing. The muntin on opening #4 and door opening #3 shall be a 2-panel door as per mutually agreed upon by staff; L. Devlin 2nd.

Board: N. Heitz states the motion will minimize the cost to the applicant and is slightly disjointed.

Vote: 4/2 in favor of motion; E. LeBlanc and R. D'Arinzo dissenting.

- B. HRPB Project Number 23-01100003: Consideration of a final plat map application for the Gulfstream Hotel project, generally located at 1 Lake Avenue, 11 Lake Avenue, and 12, 14, 20, 22, and 24 South Lakeside Drive. The subject site is located in the Downtown (DT) zoning district and has a future land use designation of Downtown Mixed Use (DMU). The subject property is also located in the South Palm Park Historic District.
- **Staff:** A. Greening- apprises the Board of the status of the preliminary requirements for the Gulfstream Plat. Parcel 1 shows the Historic structure. Some easements are being placed, some released and some temporary for utility work.
- **Staff:** W. Waters advises there will be an additional utility easement. Within the nearly 10-feet along the alley not being vacated, there will be underground utilities.

Public Comment: Wes Blackman, 241 Columbia Dr., encouraged Board members to recommend said request to the City Commission for approval.

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve HRPB 23-01100003 with staff recommended Conditions for a final plat as the proposal meets the applicable criteria based on the data and analysis in the staff report; E. LeBlanc 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

PLANNING ISSUES: None

PUBLIC COMMENTS: (3 minute limit) None

DEPARTMENT REPORTS: None

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS: E. Sita is missed.

ADJOURNMENT 6:59 PM